REVIEW

of the dissertation submitted for official review

Laura Baitleuova on the theme «Formation of professional foreign language communicative competence of medical students» submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty «8D01705 - Foreign Language: Two Foreign Languages».

№	Criteria	Eligibility (one of the options must be checked)	Justification of the position of the official reviewer
1.	The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:	The topic and content of the doctoral research strictly align with the priority areas for the development of science in the Republic of Kazakhstan and comply with the mandates of state strategic programs. The dissertation directly aligns with the objectives outlined in the Concept for the Development of Higher Education and Science in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023–2029, specifically concerning the internationalization of higher education, the transformation of domestic medical education in accordance with international standards, and the enhancement of the global competitiveness of future healthcare professionals. Furthermore, the study's focus on training multilingual professional personnel fully complies with the strategic directions of the state language policy.
		1) The thesis was completed as part of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program) 2) The thesis was completed as part of another state program (indicate the name of the program) 3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)	The dissertation demonstrates complete substantive and conceptual alignment with the strategic priority areas for the development of science officially approved by the Supreme Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, specifically responding to the priority direction of "Improving the quality of higher education and enhancing the training of highly qualified, competitive specialists." The core orientations of the work are directly aimed at addressing the tasks as part of the Concept for the Development of Language Policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023–2029 (Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 16, 2023, No. 914), which include advancing multilingual professional education, strengthening international academic cooperation, and ensuring the integration of domestic specialists into the global scientific community. Furthermore, this research represents a fundamental applied inquiry that implements the provisions of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education," the strategic document "National Priorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2025" approved by Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 26, 2021, No. 520, as well as the mandates of the Concept for the Development of Higher Education and Science for 2023–2029, thereby directly fulfilling the objectives of the State Compulsory Educational Standards (SCES) in the field of healthcare. The contemporary redesign of the linguodidactic and methodological system for developing the professional foreign language communicative competence (PFLCC) of future physicians and medical students aligns fully with global strategies for modernizing higher medical education, scientifically addressing

			the imperative for healthcare personnel to participate proficiently in international scientific-professional communication and medical information exchange processes.
2.	Importance for science	The work makes/does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed/not disclosed	The research contributes significantly to the development of the theory and practice of professional foreign language teaching. For the first time, the structure and content of the professional foreign language communicative competence of medical students have been comprehensively substantiated from a theoretical perspective and defined as an interconnected system of communicative, socio-cultural, medico-linguistic, and professional-communicative sub-competences. The scientific significance of the study is demonstrated in several dimensions. *First*, the theoretical foundations for applying the principled eclecticism approach in foreign language teaching have been expanded. *Second*, a comprehensive needs analysis of the current state of English language teaching in medical universities of Kazakhstan was conducted for the first time. *Third*, an integrated curriculum combining General English (GE) and English for Medical Purposes (EMP) components specifically for medical students was developed. These innovations enrich the theory of professional foreign language teaching in non-linguistic higher education institutions and contribute to the advancement of domestic linguodidactics.
3.	The principle of independence	Self-reliance level: 1) High; 2) Medium; 3) Low; 4) No independence	The level of independent authorship is high. The doctoral thesis clearly reflects the personal research outcomes achieved by the doctoral student. All core components of the study—including the needs analysis, content analysis of curriculum programs, questionnaire design, methodological model construction, compilation of instructional materials, and the execution of the pedagogical experiment—were carried out in a consistent and systematic manner. In the course of the research, data were gathered from 901 medical students and 31 English language instructors, a content analysis was performed on the curricula of 4 universities, and semi-structured interviews were conducted with 16 students and 5 instructors. It is evident that these data were collected under the direct initiative of the doctoral student. The author's contribution in the published works is indicated at the level of 85–100%, which substantiates the high degree of independence of the work. The doctoral candidate's independent scientific positioning is clearly manifested in the construction of the author's original model of professional foreign language communicative competence, the systematization of the needs analysis results, and the analysis of the pedagogical experiment findings.
4.	The principle of inner unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis: 1) Justified; 2) Partially justified; 3) Not justified.	The relevance of the dissertation is comprehensively substantiated. Drawing upon the legislative framework of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the goals of internationalizing higher medical education within the scope of participation in the Bologna Process, and the specific gaps in the English language preparation of medical professionals in Kazakhstan, the study's relevance is demonstrated through an integrated approach.

			The relevance of the work is defined by its orientation toward resolving the primary contradiction of applied linguodidactics in the contemporary higher medical education—namely, the gap between the growing global scientific and informational influx in healthcare and the actual level of professional-clinical communicative readiness of future physicians. The doctoral student has elevated this relevance to a new level by not merely describing the issue theoretically, but by identifying the substantive and structural discrepancies within the practice of domestic medical higher education institutions on the basis of concrete empirical data. The scientific work provides a profound linguodidactic substantiation for the necessity of increasing the international competitiveness of healthcare specialists and transforming the medical education process in accordance with European standards, which demonstrates that this research is a highly timely and critically important work for contemporary higher school methodology and practice.
		4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis: 1) Reflects; 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect	The title of the dissertation is in complete harmony with all three chapters of the study: *the first* chapter encompasses the theoretical and methodological foundations of professional foreign language communicative competence; *the second* chapter addresses the needs analysis and the design of the original methodological model based on the principle of principled eclecticism; and *the third* chapter comprises the experimental-pedagogical validation of this model along with the quantitative and qualitative analysis of its results. Consequently, the content of the work fully and profoundly reflects the research topic. Furthermore, the alignment of the work's content with its topic is substantiated by the logical completion and targeted orientation of the scientific problems addressed in the dissertation. By taking the specific linguistic phenomenon of medical professional discourse (Medical English) as a foundation, the author has integrated the language preparation of students with the authentic requirements of the clinical environment, rendering the substantive outcomes of the research explicitly evident. The theoretical arguments within the text of the dissertation, the developed syllabi, the original instructional materials, and the assessment tools are all centralized around the core concept of "professional foreign language communicative competence" and directed toward measuring its development level. This demonstrates that the structure of the research fully encompasses the scope of the topic, comprehensively elucidating it at a didactic level.
		4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis: 1) correspond; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond	The research objective and the five specific tasks formulated fully correspond to the title of the dissertation. The sequence of the established tasks defines the logical structure of the study; each task has been fully executed within the respective chapters, finding its definitive empirical and theoretical solution. Furthermore, the harmony of the objective and tasks with the content of the topic is clearly manifested in the logical-structural integrity (architectonics) of the dissertation. While the first and second tasks are directed toward examining the theoretical-methodological

			foundations of foreign language teaching and analyzing current needs in medical higher education institutions, the third and fourth tasks directly encompass the process of designing an integrated curriculum and an original model based on the principle of "principled eclecticism," and the concluding fifth task aims to experimentally validate the effectiveness of the proposed methodology. Consequently, the targeted orientation of the research and the resulting scientific tasks do not deviate from the scope of the topic, logically complement one another, and fully enable a comprehensive substantiation of the primary research hypothesis put forward by the doctoral student.
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected: 1) completely interconnected; 2) the interconnection is partial; 3) there is no interconnection	The logical level of the dissertation and the interconnection of all its structural components are high. The first chapter, which analyzes the theoretical and methodological foundations, establishes international practice and contemporary linguodidactic approaches, thereby laying the groundwork for the second chapter dedicated to the needs analysis and the design of the original model; in turn, the integrated curriculum and methodological model developed in the second chapter serve as the direct baseline for the experimental-pedagogical validation in the third chapter. In this sequence, the primary research hypothesis formulated in the introduction, arising from the object and subject of the scientific inquiry, has found its complete proof and confirmation through the quantitative-qualitative indicators and mathematical-statistical analyses conducted in the third chapter, which substantiates the internal integrity and coherent structure of the work.
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions: 1) there is a critical analysis; 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis does not represent one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors	The dissertation provides a comprehensive critical and theoretical analysis of the fundamental works of both Kazakhstani (Stamgaliyeva, Yelubayeva, Shaikhyzada, Zhyltyrova, etc.) and foreign (Hutchinson & Waters, Dudley-Evans & St John, Kumaravadivelu, Celce-Murcia, etc.) scholars. By analyzing the strengths and weaknesses of previously established traditional methodological concepts, the doctoral student scientifically substantiates the newly proposed linguodidactic solutions and clearly establishes the primary advantages and conceptual distinctions of the original methodological model in comparison with existing similar frameworks. The validity of the innovative solutions in the doctoral student's work is determined by the first systematic transformation of the principled eclecticism approach within the global "post-method paradigm" specifically applied to the context of medical higher education. While previous studies predominantly favored teaching English through a single method within a rigid framework (for instance, exclusively communicative or exclusively cognitive), this work integrates the most effective elements of various didactic approaches based on the results of a concrete learner needs analysis and proves its efficacy in comparison with established solutions. The proposed integrated model (a synthesis of GE and EMP components) is critically highly valued for its capacity to address the linguistic needs of medical students not merely at a pragmatic level, but fully in accordance with the authentic

			cognitive-contextual demands of the clinical environment, demonstrating greater flexibility and targeted orientation than existing standard curricula.
5.	Scientific novelty principle	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The scientific novelty of the dissertation is fully comprehensive, distinct, and empirically and theoretically proven. The novelty of the research is determined by the following fundamental results: *first*, a large-scale and comprehensive needs analysis was conducted for the first time on the current state of English language teaching to medical students in Kazakhstan, encompassing 5 leading universities, 901 students, and 31 instructors; *second*, a deep content analysis of existing curricula was performed, precisely identifying structural imbalances between General English (GE) and English for Medical Purposes (EMP); *third*, a unique structural-substantive system of professional foreign language communicative competence, composed of 4 interconnected core sub-competences and accounting for the specific characteristics of the medical field, was modeled for the first time; *fourth*, the global concept of "principled eclecticism" was adapted to the context of domestic medical education and introduced as a new methodological approach; *fifth*, as an applied manifestation of the theoretical findings, an innovative collection of instructional materials titled "English for Medical Purposes" was developed and officially registered with a certificate of authorship.
		5.2 Are the dissertation findings new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The main conclusions of the research are entirely novel and are comprehensively proven on an empirical basis. As the primary outcomes of this innovative inquiry, it was established that the content of General English (GE) excessively dominates the English language teaching process in Kazakhstani medical higher education institutions, a situation that significantly restricts the actual professional-clinical communicative readiness of future physicians. Furthermore, the examination of learners' objective demands revealed that the highest priority scope of student needs encompasses skills in working with specialized professional vocabulary, speaking fluently on clinical-medical topics, and reading and comprehending complex medical texts in a foreign language. These conclusions and regularities have been conclusively proven and introduced into scientific discourse within domestic higher science for the first time through a comprehensive study (specialized screening and surveying) specific to the context of medical education in Kazakhstan.
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and reasonable: 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are	The proposed pedagogical, methodological, and organizational solutions possess a fully novel character and are thoroughly substantiated. The innovative curriculum and original methodological model, which integrate the instruction of General English (GE) and English for Medical Purposes (EMP) into a unified didactic platform, represent an entirely new and highly effective pedagogical-technological and managerial solution within the context of Kazakhstani medical higher education. This model is aimed at engansing the educational process on the basis of contemporary linguodidactic principles, systematizing the content of instructional materials in accordance with international standards, and establishing a new

		new)	algorithm for managing the quality of training for future physicians.
6.	The validity of the main findings	All main conclusions are/are not based on scientifically valid evidence or well-grounded (for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities)	All the primary conclusions of the dissertation are scientifically significant and substantiated by a three-tiered data set. First, the quantitative database was gathered from 901 students and 31 instructors sampled from 5 leading domestic universities and processed via descriptive statistics (frequencies, mean values, and standard deviation), while the results of the Likert-scale questionnaire were systematized using the international IPA (Importance-Performance Analysis) quadrant analysis method to determine levels of importance and performance. Second, the qualitative data were derived from semi-structured interviews conducted with 16 students and 5 instructors and formulated through in-depth thematic analysis, while reflective journals and classroom observation protocols were successfully utilized as supplementary data to ensure the principle of triangulation. Third, regarding the pedagogical experiment data, the pre-test and post-test results of the experimental (n=17) and control (n=17) groups were rigorously compared, fully confirming the initial scientific hypothesis of the research. While the mean total score of the experimental group constituted 17.94/50 in the pre-test, it significantly increased to 33.76/50 in the post-test (a net gain of +15.82 points), qualitatively outperforming the progress observed in the control group (from 16.47 to 26.24, a gain of +9.77 points). According to the dynamics of competence levels, 17.6% of the learners in the experimental group reached the "Advanced" level in the post-test, whereas no such high-level performance indicator was recorded in the control group taught via the traditional method.
7.	The main provisions for the defense	It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately: 7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven; 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; 2) no 7.3 Is it new? 1) yes; 2) no	**Principle 1:** The current state of English language teaching in Kazakhstani medical faculties is characterized by a gap between the actual communicative needs of students and existing instructional practices. 7.1 Has the principle been proven? Yes, it has been proven. The validity of this proposition has been comprehensively substantiated by a triangulated database gathered within a mixed-methods framework, specifically through the integration of quantitative screening and qualitative interview results. 7.2 Is it trivial? No. This proposition is not trivial, as it does not merely rest upon a superficial statement of fact, but for the first time elucidates the internal structural contradictions of the linguodidactic process in the domestic higher medical education at a scientific and analytical level. 7.3 Is it novel? Yes. The formulation possesses an entirely novel character, as the nature of the gap and the scale of the imbalances between the pragmatic demands of students and the content of existing curricula within the context of Kazakhstani medical education have not previously been diagnosed in this exact format in domestic science. 7.4 Scope of application: Broad. The patterns identified and the conclusions drawn during the research possess a wide scope of application, as they are not restricted to a single higher

		7.4 Application level: 1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes; 2) no	education institution but can serve as a direct basis for reforming educational programs, syllabi, and instructional-methodological complexes across all non-linguistic and medical faculties in the country. 7.5 Has it been proven in a paper? Yes. The scientific validity of this principle is fully confirmed on the basis of survey data from 901 students and 31 instructors sampled from 5 leading domestic universities, as well as the content analysis results of the curricula of 4 higher education institutions, in a large-scale research paper published in the reputable peer-reviewed journal *Novitas-ROYAL*, which is indexed in the international Scopus database. **Principle 2:** A comparative analysis of the curricula reveals a structural mismatch between their content and professional requirements. 7.1 Has the principle been proven? Yes, it has been proven. The substantive imbalances and internal proportions of the educational programs that do not align with professional demands have been clearly demonstrated and fully proven through empirical analysis methods. 7.2 Is it trivial? No. This conclusion is not trivial, as it does not merely offer a superficial overview of the syllabi, but subjects their structural proportions aimed at developing professional foreign language communicative competence to a deep quantitative and qualitative screening. 7.3 Is it novel? Yes. It is novel because the degree of mismatch between the content of existing standard curricula in domestic medical higher education institutions and the demands of medical professional discourse has been specifically analyzed as part of this research for the first time. 7.4 Scope of application: Broad. The results of this comparative analysis and the methodological conclusions possess a wide scope of application, as they can serve as a foundation for revising and optimizing the curricula and content of language disciplines in any higher medical school. 7.5 Has it been proven in a paper? Yes. The results demonstrating that the General English (GE) component significantly dominates over English for Medical Purposes (EMP)—obtained during a comprehensive content analysis performed on the syllabi of 4 leading domestic medical universities—have been officially published in the proceedings of an international congress held in Ankara. **Principle 3:** Improving university English language instruction requires a curriculum redesign that prioritizes professional communicative situations. 7.1 Has it been proven? Yes, it has been proven. The necessity and effectiveness of restructuring a clinically-oriented curriculum have been practically demonstrated through the phased implementation of the developed original program into the educational process. 7.2 Is it trivial? No. This proposition is not trivial, as it does not imply a superficial updating of instructional materials, but rather demands a conceptual redesign of the educational

			architectonics (curriculum redesign) in higher school didactics based on pragmatic priorities such as the "doctor-patient" discourse. 7.3 Is it novel? Yes. It possesses a novel character because a new curriculum design algorithm that integrates General English (GE) and English for Medical Purposes (EMP) components at a unified cognitive-contextual level is being proposed for the first time within the context of Kazakhstani linguodidactics. 7.4 Scope of application: Broad. The proposed curriculum redesign model and teaching principles can be widely utilized as a universal methodological tool for designing professionally-oriented language courses across other non-linguistic higher education institutions in the country. 7.5 Has it been proven in a paper? Yes. The structure of the integrated original program prioritizing communicative situations and its effectiveness in enhancing the language competence of future physicians have been fully published and confirmed in relevant peer-reviewed scientific publications and international conference proceedings. **Principle 4:** Developing PFLCC requires an integrated methodological model that systematizes 4 sub-competences. 7.1 Has the principle been proven? Yes, it has been proven. The necessity of a unified system consisting of 4 sub-competences for developing the professional foreign language communicative competence of future physicians has been fully substantiated in the theoretical chapters of the dissertation and validated experimentally. 7.2 Is it trivial? No. This proposition is not trivial, as it does not treat language training merely as a general set of skills, but deconstructs and systematizes it into 4-tiered structural components adapted to the specific characteristics of the medical field. 7.3 Is it novel? Yes. It possesses an entirely novel character because the global concept of principled eclecticism within the "post-method paradigm" is integrated into the context of domestic medical higher education and presented in the form of a new original methodological model for the first time. 7.4 Scope of application: Broad. The integrated methodological model and instructional algorithms that systematize the 4 proposed sub-competences can be widely utilized for modeling and developing professional language competences across any non-linguistic higher education institution at both the domestic and international levels. 7.5 Has it been proven in a paper? Yes. The structure, content, and practical application potential of this theoretical-methodological model based on the principled eclecticism approach have been fully published in leading peer-reviewed scientific journals in the field of higher education and in the proceedings of international scientific-practical conferences. **Principle 5:** The effectiveness of the pedagogical model was confirmed by the experiment. 7.1 Has the principle been proven? Yes, it has been proven. The effectiveness of the

			proposed "principled eclecticism" model has been fully proven through a rigorous comparison of pre-test and post-test indicators from a 15-week targeted pedagogical experiment conducted on the baseline of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (KazNU). 7.2 Is it trivial? No. This conclusion is not trivial, as the progress recorded in the experimental group is not random in nature; rather, it qualitatively and level-wise significantly outperforms the traditional instruction outcomes of the control group, demonstrating a definitive mathematical regularity. 7.3 Is it novel? Yes. It is novel because a mixed-methods assessment system that measures the language preparation of future physicians across clinical cases, role-plays, and medical terminology acquisition sections has been applied within domestic practice for the first time. 7.4 Scope of application: Broad. This instructional model and its evaluation tools, which demonstrated high efficacy during the experiment, can be widely implemented into the educational process and instructional-methodological complexes of all higher medical education institutions in the country. 7.5 Has it been proven in a paper? Yes. The pedagogical experiment results—demonstrating that the experimental group reached a score of 33.76/50 in the post-test (a gain of +15.82 points) and that 17.6% of the learners officially demonstrated an "Advanced" level—have been fully reflected and approved in recognized domestic and international scientific publications.
8.	The principle of reliability Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology - is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail 1) yes; 2) no	The research methodology is comprehensively described and profoundly substantiated from a scientific perspective. The dissertation successfully applies a mixed-methods research design, establishing an organic synthesis of quantitative (large-scale surveying, curriculum content analysis, and a quasi-experimental pedagogical experiment) and qualitative (semi-structured interviews, in-depth thematic analysis, reflective journals, and classroom observation) approaches, which completely corresponds to the established research questions and tasks. To perform statistical processing of empirical data and ensure validity, descriptive statistical measures (frequencies, mean values, and standard deviation) were utilized, alongside a quasi-experimental design based on comparing pre-test and post-test results with a control group, as well as the international IPA (Importance-Performance Analysis) quadrant analysis method to determine levels of importance and performance.
		8.2 The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies: 1) yes;	Yes, the results of the dissertation research were obtained through the application of contemporary scientific inquiry methods, as well as the digital processing and interpretation of data using computer technologies and specialized software. During the initial stage of gathering empirical materials, the Google Forms platform was effectively utilized, ensuring large-scale remote surveying of respondents and maintaining a high level of data confidentiality and accuracy. The processes of statistical calculation and mathematical modeling of the extensive quantitative indicators obtained were executed in the Microsoft

		2) no	Excel software suite, where specialized functions, including STDEV.S(), were applied to determine mean values, calculate frequency distributions, and find the standard deviation substantiating the homogeneity of the sample. To further uncover the qualitative-pragmatic nature of the survey results and visualize the needs of students and instructors, the Likert-scale data were mapped via computer technology onto an IPA (Importance-Performance Analysis) quadrant diagram and accurately interpreted graphically. Furthermore, in systematizing the qualitative data obtained from interviews and reflective journals, a contemporary thematic analysis methodology was applied, with the processes of data coding and categorization fully executed in accordance with a scientific algorithm.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment): 1) yes; 2) no	Yes, all the theoretical propositions and methodological models formulated in the dissertation, along with the identified interconnections and regularities, were fully proven, actualized, and substantiated during a specially organized pedagogical experiment. In accordance with the requirements of the pedagogical sciences field, a large-scale experimental-pedagogical study spanning 15 weeks was conducted on the baseline of the Faculty of Medicine and Healthcare at Al-Farabi Kazakh National University (KazNU) to evaluate the effectiveness of the author's proposed linguodidactic system. As part of the experimental study, two homogeneous groups were sampled: the experimental group (n=17) was taught using the integrated innovative model designed by the doctoral student based on the principle of "principled eclecticism," while the control group (n=17) was instructed as part of the approved traditional academic curriculum. The results of the final assessment (post-test), conducted at the end of the instructional period, demonstrated that across all evaluation sections, the professional language indicators of the experimental group were significantly higher, both qualitatively and quantitatively, than those of the control group.
		8.4 Important statements are confirmed / partially confirmed / not confirmed by references to current and reliable scientific literature	Yes, all the significant theoretical conclusions, methodological arguments, and scientific propositions advanced in the dissertation research are fully proven and substantiated by referencing current, reliable, and internationally recognized scientific literature. The bibliographic apparatus of the research encompasses 107 fundamental works that are highly relevant to the fields of linguodidactics and applied linguistics. The study extensively analyzes and successfully integrates the concepts of renowned domestic scholars (S.S. Kunanbayeva, A.T. Yelubayeva, Z.A. Shaikhyzada, A.T. Zhyltyrova, etc.) who shaped the methodology and language education paradigms of the Kazakhstani higher school, adapting them to the local educational context. Furthermore, the author has deeply and critically scrutinized the works of leading Western researchers who form the golden fund of global linguodidactics and laid the theoretical foundations for Language for Specific Purposes (ESP/EMP) and the post-method era (T. Hutchinson & A. Waters, T. Dudley-Evans, B. Kumaravadivelu, M. Celce-Murcia, Z. Dörnyei, H.D. Brown, etc.). Since the vast majority of the bibliographic sources consist of prestigious international high-impact scientific

			journals and peer-reviewed publications, the scientific validity and informational reliability of every key statement and assertion within the text of the dissertation are throughly ensured.
		8.5 Used literature sources are sufficient/not sufficient for a literature review	Yes, the sources of literature utilized in the dissertation research are entirely sufficient and representative for conducting a comprehensive and in-depth literature review on the topic. The 114 scientific sources included in the bibliographic apparatus of the work provided a full opportunity to comprehensively analyze the historical stages of the issue's formation, contemporary development trends, and unresolved critical aspects. The scope and quality of the literature employed by the doctoral student are theoretically completely sufficient to elucidate the methodological foundations of professionally-oriented language training in medical higher education institutions, the structural components of PFLCC, and the linguodidactic potential of the "principled eclecticism" approach. Within the literature review section, the results of domestic and international studies are not merely listed in a descriptive manner, but the scientific continuity and conceptual connections among them are deeply and critically analyzed and systematized.
9	Practical value principle	9.1 The thesis has theoretical value: 1) yes; 2) no	Yes, the theoretical significance of the dissertation research is high, and it substantially enriches the theoretical-methodological foundations of professionally-oriented foreign language instruction in non-linguistic higher education institutions. The theoretical value of the work is primarily determined by the fact that, taking into account the demands of the contemporary healthcare sector and international standards, the multidimensional structure and substantive components of the professional foreign language communicative competence (PFLCC) of medical students have been profoundly substantiated from a theoretical perspective for the first time. Furthermore, the research elucidates the linguodidactic potential of the "principled eclecticism" approach within the global "post-method paradigm," extending its theoretical framework for application in non-linguistic higher education institutions, specifically within the medical education system. In this manner, the proposed conceptual formulations make a qualitative and significant contribution to the theory of foreign language teaching methodology within the context of higher professional education aligned with international standards in the Republic of Kazakhstan.
		9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice: 1) yes; 2) no	The practical significance of the dissertation is clear. The developed methodological model can be directly applied in the process of teaching English to medical students in higher education institutions. The instructional materials compilation, "English for Medical Purposes" (Copyright Certificate № 69208, 2026), can be used as a ready-made resource in practice. Furthermore, the original program integrated with EMP can be adapted to the curricula of medical universities. The results can also be utilized in training future foreign language teachers as part of the discipline "Methods of Foreign Language Teaching."

		9.3 Are the practice suggestions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	Yes, the practical recommendations and linguodidactic guidelines proposed in the dissertation possess a fully novel character and represent an important innovative product for the practice of the domestic medical higher school. The original curriculum, which integrates the instruction of General English (GE) and English for Medical Purposes (EMP) into a unified didactic platform, the compilation of instructional materials titled "English for Medical Purposes" protected by an official copyright certificate, and the practical variants of the methodological model based on the principle of "principled eclecticism" together constitute an entirely new complex of applied, highly effective pedagogical solutions for the Kazakhstani medical education system. These recommendations move away from traditional reproductive teaching methods and offer concrete tools for training students in accordance with the actual pragmatic and professional-communicative demands of the clinical environment.
10.	The quality of writing and design	Academic writing quality: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The dissertation is written in accordance with the highest standards of scientific language. The text is characterized by logical consistency, terminological precision inherent to the scientific style, academic literacy, and a cohesive, continuous narrative manner. The structural organization of the dissertation (normative references, definitions, designations and abbreviations, introduction, three main chapters, independent conclusions for each chapter, general conclusion, list of references used, and an extensive archive of applied appendices) fully complies with the state standard requirements and architectonic regularities established for PhD doctoral dissertations within the higher education system. The tables and figures designed to visualize the instructional-methodological materials and research data are of high quality in terms of informativeness and are meticulously formatted. Notably, the descriptive statistics results (measures of frequency, mean values, and standard deviation) obtained within the mixed-methods framework are clearly presented through tabular models, while the international IPA quadrant diagram, constructed based on the processing of Likert-scale data, visualizes the objective language needs of the students in a graphic and profoundly scientific-analytical manner. The formatting of the bibliographic apparatus and the list of references meets general academic requirements.
11.	Notes on a thesis		The dissertation research is evaluated as a scientifically sound, topically relevant, systematically structured, and highly practically significant study. Concurrently, with the aim of further enhancing the quality of the work, the following recommendations are offered. *First*, the sample size of the experimental-pedagogical study possesses a somewhat limited character (n=17 in the experimental group, n=17 in the control group, for a total of n=34 learners). Although this scope is methodologically substantiated within the local context and the specific target group, and is deemed appropriate for exploratory pilot research, it limits to a certain degree the generalizability of the obtained results to a broader

			educational environment; therefore, the doctoral student is advised to consider a significant expansion of the sample size in future scientific inquiries. *Second*, insufficient information is provided regarding the instructor and the organization of the educational process in the control group during the experiment: specifically, the lack of a comprehensive description detailing exactly who taught this group, their level of professional pedagogical experience, and the specific standard textbooks utilized within the traditional curriculum complicates a thorough assessment of the equality of the experimental conditions. These aforementioned remarks do not diminish the scientific value of the dissertation. They in no way negate the substantial academic and applied importance of the work for domestic linguodidactics and the higher medical education system.
12.	Scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the topic of research (in case of defense of the dissertation in the form of a series of articles, the official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each article of the doctoral student on the topic of research)		The indicators of the doctoral student's scientific publications are characterized by a high level from both a quantitative and qualitative perspective. The results of the analysis of medical students' needs and academic self-efficacy, which constitute the core of the research, were published in the prestigious international journal "Novitas-ROYAL," indexed in the Scopus database (2025, author's contribution — 85%). Since an international IPA-analysis design based on the Likert scale and computer information technologies was applied in this article, its scientific validity and high academic standing are fully proven. Furthermore, 4 articles were published with a 90% author's contribution by the doctoral student in leading domestic journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in the Field of Science and Higher Education of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the methodology of professional foreign language instruction, contemporary MELF theory, and active lexical gaming approaches were examined in the pedagogical and philological series of the "Bulletin of Al-Farabi KazNU," while issues regarding the empirical assessment of students' communicative preparation were clarified in the "Bulletin of Karaganda University named after E.A. Buketov." The geography of the research outcomes' approbation is exceptionally wide, as evidenced by 3 articles published in the proceedings of an international congress in Ankara and the conferences "Farabi World" and "Akhanov Readings." The innovative instructional materials compilation titled "English for Medical Purposes," which represents the main practical product of the dissertation, was officially registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan and legally secured by copyright certificate № 69208 (2026). Thus, the comprehensive set of publications and intellectual property documents demonstrates the high theoretical and practical level of the dissertation and fully complies with the state regulatory requirements for awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 8D01705 — "Foreign Language: Two Foreign Languages."

13.	Decision of the official reviewer (pursuant to paragraph 28 of the present Model Regulations)		The dissertation of Laura Baitleuova titled "Formation of professional foreign language communicative competence of medical students" fully satisfies all the requirements established for obtaining the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 8D01705 — "Foreign Language: Two Foreign Languages." In terms of scientific novelty, theoretical significance, practical value, reliability of data, quality of publications, and the level of academic writing, the dissertation completely complies with the standards prescribed for a PhD doctoral thesis.

Official Reviewer:
Abai Kazakh National Pedagogical University
PhD, Senior Lecturer

Aibolat Nabidullin

05.22.2026

РАСТАЙМЫН: «Абай атындағы ҚазҰПУ» КЕАҚ
КАДР САЯСАТЫ БАСҚАРМАСЫНЫҢ ЖЕТЕКШІСІ
ЗАВЕРЯЮ: руководителя
УПРАВЛЕНИЯ КАДРОВОЙ ПОЛИТИКИ
НАО «КазНПУ им Абая»
ҚОЛЫ
ПОДПИСЬ_____