

**REVIEW**  
of the official reviewer for dissertation work of Haftamu Kiros Tekare on the topic «The comparative analysis of framing of human trafficking in contemporary print media» submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program «8D03201-Journalism»

| №  | Criteria                                                                                                                               | Eligibility (one of the options must be checked)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Justification of the position of the official reviewer                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. | The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science and/or state programs | <p>1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:</p> <p>1) The thesis was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program)</p> <p>2) The thesis was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program)</p> <p>3) <u>The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)</u></p> | <p>The topic of the dissertation research, «The comparative analysis of framing of human trafficking in contemporary print media» devoted to the media framing of human trafficking in The Astana Times and The Ethiopian Herald newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia, corresponds to the priority directions of science development and state priorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of combating human trafficking, protecting human rights and safeguarding vulnerable populations. The study addresses socially significant issues related to media representation, public awareness and communication processes concerning human trafficking.</p> <p>The dissertation is consistent with the Law of the Republic Kazakhstan “On Countering Human Trafficking” (Law No.110-VIII dated July 5, 2024), which establishes the organizational and legal frameworks for preventing human trafficking, protecting victims and strengthening public awareness of trafficking-related issues. The research contributes to the advancement of media and communication studies and supports national</p> |

|    |                        |                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|----|------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                        |                                                                                                                                        | priorities aimed at promoting social development, human rights protection and the prevention of human trafficking.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 2. | Importance for science | The work <u>makes</u> /does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is <u>well disclosed</u> /not disclosed | <p>The dissertation of Haftamu Kiros Tekare makes a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed. The study addresses the significant issue of human trafficking through a comparative analysis of media framing in newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia. By examining how the issue is represented and framed in two different national and socio-cultural contexts, this research fills a gap in the existing literature on media framing, human trafficking, and comparative media studies.</p> <p>The scientific importance of the dissertation lies in its application of framing theory to identify similarities and differences in the reporting practices of newspapers from the two countries.</p> <p>The comparative approach enhances understanding of how media organizations construct narratives around human trafficking and how these narratives may influence public awareness, stakeholder perceptions, and policy discussions. The study therefore contributes to the advancement of knowledge in journalism, media studies and communication research.</p> <p>The importance of the work is clearly disclosed through its theoretical and practical implications. The findings provide valuable insights to scholars, media professionals, policymakers, and organizations involved in anti-trafficking efforts in Kazakhstan and Ethiopia and beyond. By offering</p> |

|    |                               |                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|----|-------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                               |                                                                                                                            | empirical evidence on media portrayals of human trafficking across different contexts and countries, the dissertation contributes to the development of more informed media practices and policy responses to this global challenge.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 3. | The principle of independence | Self-reliance level:<br>1) <b>High</b> ;<br>2) Medium;<br>3) Low;<br>4) No independence                                    | The author's level of independence is assessed as <b>high</b> . Through the research process, the author demonstrated a strong ability to independently formulate research objectives, select and apply appropriate theoretical and methodological approaches, collect and analyze empirical data, and interpret the findings. The dissertation reflects the author's independent engagement with a substantial body of scientific literature and a critical understanding of the research problem. |
| 4. | The principle of inner unity  | 4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:<br>1) <b>Justified</b> ;<br>2) Partially justified;<br>3) Not justified. | The relevance of the dissertation is <b>justified</b> . Human trafficking remains a significant social, humanitarian and policy challenge at both national and international levels. The dissertation addresses this issue through a comparative analysis of media framing in The Astana Times and The Ethiopian Herald, thereby examining how the problem is                                                                                                                                       |

|  |                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <p>represented in two distinct socio-cultural and media environments. Given the important role of the media in shaping public awareness and influencing policy discussions, the research topic is both timely and socially significant.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|  | <p>4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis:</p> <p>1) <b><u>Reflects</u></b>;</p> <p>2) Partially reflects;</p> <p>3) Does not reflect</p> | <p>The relevance of the study is further supported by the limited number of comparative investigations of human trafficking coverage across different national contexts. By analyzing thematic emphases, source usage, media functions and framing patterns in the selected newspapers, the dissertation contributes to a deeper understanding of how media narratives about human trafficking are constructed and communicated. The author convincingly demonstrates the scientific and practical significance of the research problem, providing a well-founded justification of the dissertation's relevance.</p> | <p>The content of the dissertation fully <b>reflects</b> its stated topic. The theoretical chapters comprehensively examine human trafficking from global and comparative perspectives and contextual similarities and differences between the two countries. The dissertation also provides a thorough discussion of media and human trafficking, framing theory, media framing approaches and major scholarly debates surrounding framing research.</p> <p>The empirical component directly addresses the research topic through a systematic analysis of human trafficking coverage in The Asatana Times and The Ethiopian Herald newspapers focusing on the extent of coverage, story type, types of trafficking, thematic emphases, source usage, media functions and framing patterns. The methodology.</p> |

|  |                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | findings, discussion and conclusions are consistently aligned with the research objectives and collectively contribute to understanding how human trafficking is framed in the newspapers. Consequently, the content of the dissertation comprehensively and accurately reflects the stated topic. |
|  | <p>4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis:</p> <p>1) <b><u>correspond</u></b>;</p> <p>2) partially correspond;</p> <p>3) do not correspond</p> | <p>The purpose and objectives of the dissertation <b>correspond</b> to the stated topic. The purpose of the study is clearly formulated and focuses on a comparative analysis of the framing of human trafficking in contemporary print media of Kazakhstan and Ethiopia, which is fully consistent with the subject and scope of the research.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|  | 4.4 All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically                                                                                                                   | <p>The stated objectives are logically stem from the research problem and provide an appropriate framework for achieving the research purpose. In particular, the dissertation examines the theoretical foundations of media framing and human trafficking research, analyzes the patterns and characteristics of human trafficking coverage in The Astana Times and The Ethiopian Herald newspapers, identify and analyze story types, extent of coverage, themes, sources, frames, media functions and compares the framing practices of the selected newspapers. Thus, the objectives are systematically addressed through theoretical discussion, methodological design, empirical analysis and conclusions, demonstrating a clear correspondence between the topic, purpose and objectives of the dissertation.</p> | All sections and provisions of the dissertation are                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | <p>interconnected:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b><u>completely interconnected</u></b>;</li> <li>2) the interconnection is partial;</li> <li>3) there is no interconnection</li> </ol>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <p>completely interconnected. The dissertation is characterized by a coherent and well-organized structure in which each three chapter and section contributes to the development of the overall research argument. The theoretical framework, research methodology and design, findings, data analysis, conclusions and recommendations are logically linked and consistently support the achievement of the research objectives.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <p>4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b><u>there is a critical analysis</u></b>;</li> <li>2) partial analysis;</li> <li>3) the analysis does not represent one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors</li> <li>4) the analysis is absent.</li> </ol> | <p>The progression of the study from the conceptual and theoretical foundations to the empirical investigation and interpretation of results is systematic and well substantiated. The findings are clearly derived from the data analysis while the conclusions and recommendations are grounded in the research results. Accordingly, this logical consistency demonstrates a high degree of internal unity and ensures the integrity of the dissertation as a research work.</p> | <p>The dissertation demonstrates a critical analysis of existing theoretical and empirical studies related to media framing and human trafficking. The author systematically examines and evaluates relevant scholarly approaches, concepts and research findings, identifying both their strengths and limitations. The review of the literature goes beyond a descriptive summary and reflects the author's analytical engagement with the subject matter.</p> <p>The proposed approaches and findings are substantiated through comparison with existing studies and established theoretical perspectives. The author critically assesses similarities and</p> |

|    |                              |                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|----|------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                              |                                                                                                                                                                                 | <p>differences between previous research and the results obtained in the present study, particularly in relation to the framing of human trafficking in newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia. This comparative and analytical approach enables the author to formulate well-founded conclusions and demonstrates a clear critical analysis of known solutions and perspectives in the field.</p>                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 5. | Scientific novelty principle | <p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?<br/> 1) <b>completely new</b>;<br/> 2) <u>partially new</u> (25-75% are new);<br/> 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p> | <p>The scientific results and provisions presented in the dissertation are <b>completely new</b>. The originality of the study lies in its comparative examination of media framing of human trafficking in newspapers in Kazakhstan and Ethiopia, a research area that has received limited scholarly attention. By applying framing theory to a cross-national analysis of media coverage, the dissertation produces new empirical evidence and provides fresh insights into the ways human trafficking is represented in different socio-cultural and media environments.</p> |
|    |                              | <p>5.2 Are the dissertation findings new?<br/> 1) <b>completely new</b>;</p>                                                                                                    | <p>The dissertation findings are <b>completely new</b>. The study produces original empirical findings through</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>2) <u>partially new</u> (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>                                                                                                                                       | <p>a comparative analysis of media framing of human trafficking newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia. The findings provide new evidence regarding the extent of coverage, predominant story types, thematic emphases, predominant sources, dominant frames, dominant media functions and differences in the representation of human trafficking across the selected media outlets.</p> <p>The originality of the findings is reflected in the identification of previously unexplored similarities and differences between the media coverage of human trafficking in the two countries. The dissertation offers new insights into how media narratives shape public understanding of the issue and contribute to broader social and policy discussions. The findings significantly enrich the existing body of knowledge in media and communication studies and constitute an original contribution to research on human trafficking and media framing.</p> |
|  | <p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and reasonable:</p> <p>1) <u><b>completely new</b></u>;</p> <p>2) <u>partially new</u> (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p> | <p>The management-related solutions and recommendations proposed in the dissertation are <b>completely new</b> and well substantiated. Drawing on original empirical evidence from a comparative analysis of newspapers in Kazakhstan and Ethiopia, the author develops innovative insights into the framing of human trafficking and its implications for media practice, public awareness and policy discourse.</p> <p>The proposed recommendations are grounded in a systematic analysis of the research findings and address existing gaps in media coverage and communication strategies related to human</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|    |                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|----|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <p>trafficking. The dissertation offers original approaches for enhancing the quality, balance and effectiveness of media reporting on trafficking issues, thereby contributing to informed decision-making among media professionals, policymakers and other relevant stakeholders. The proposed solutions are logically derived from the study's findings, demonstrate practical relevance and constitute a novel contribution to the field of media and communication research.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 6. | The validity of the main findings | <p>All main conclusions <u>are</u>/are not <u>based</u> on scientifically significant evidence or well-grounded (for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities)</p> | <p>All main conclusions of the dissertation are based on scientifically significant evidence. The conclusions are based on a systematic analysis of empirical data obtained from "The Astana Times" and "The Ethiopian Herald" newspapers and are supported by appropriate quantitative research methods and analytical procedures. The methodological approach employed in the study ensures the reliability and validity of the research findings.</p> <p>The conclusions are logically connected to the research objectives, theoretical frameworks and empirical results. The author provides sufficient evidence to substantiate the interpretation and demonstrates a clear relationship between the collected data, analytical findings and the resulting conclusions. Consequently, the main conclusions of the dissertation are scientifically sound, well-substantiated and convincingly supported by the research evidence.</p> |

|    |                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|----|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 7. | <p>The main provisions for the defense</p> | <p>It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?</p> <p>1) <b>Proven</b>;<br/> 2) rather proven;<br/> 3) rather not proven;<br/> 4) not proven<br/> 5) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify whether the statement has been proven.</p> | <p>The provision is <b>proven</b>. The provision submitted for defense are convincingly proven through the theoretical framework, methodological design and empirical findings of the dissertation. In particular, the study demonstrates that human trafficking receives limited media coverage relative to the extent of the problem; solution-oriented and international dimension themes receive greater emphasis than causes and extent-related themes; government officials and international organizations are the most frequently used sources; educative, solution-oriented and attribution of responsibility frames are dominant; policy and legal coverage focuses on praising anti-trafficking efforts rather than assigning blames and that editorial routines and institutional factors influence the coverage of the issue.</p> <p>These provisions are substantiated primarily through a systematic quantitative content analysis of human trafficking articles published in The Astana Times and The Ethiopian Herald newspapers during the study period. The findings are supported by clearly defined coding categories, analytical procedures, table, graphs and thematic interpretation. Moreover, supplementary qualitative in-depth interviews provided contextual insights into editorial routines and factors influencing the coverage of human trafficking. The empirical results consistently correspond to the research objectives and provide sufficient evidence to verify the stated provisions.</p> <p>The proposition is <b>not trivial</b>. It addresses a significant scientific problem and is based on a</p> |
|    |                                            | <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |

|  |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|  | <p>1) <u>yes</u>;<br/> 2) <u>no</u><br/> 3) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify whether the statement is trivial.</p>          | <p>systematic investigation of media framing of human trafficking in newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia. The provision reflects original research findings based on empirical evidence rather than self-evident or commonly accepted assumptions.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|  | <p>7.3 Is it new?<br/> 1) <u>yes</u>;<br/> 2) no<br/> 3) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify the novelty of the statement.</p> | <p>The scientific value of the provision lies in its contribution to the understanding of how media narratives construct and communicate issues related to human trafficking across different national contexts. The provision advances existing knowledge in the fields of media and communication studies and provides insights that are both theoretically meaningful and practically relevant. Therefore, it can not be regarded as trivial.</p> <p>The provision is <b>new</b>. Its novelty stems from the original empirical findings and analytical insights generated through the comparative examination of media framing of human trafficking in newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia. The provision is based on evidence obtained from the author's independent research and contributes new knowledge to the fields of media and communication studies.</p> <p>The novelty of the provision is further reflected in its identification of previously unexplored framing patterns, cross-national similarities and differences and their implications for public understanding and policy discourse. The provision extends existing scholarship and offers original perspectives that enhance the current understanding of media representations of human trafficking. Hence, the provision possesses a clear degree of scientific novelty.</p> |
|  | 7.4 Application level:                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |                                                                                                                                                                                         | <p>1) narrow;<br/> 2) medium;<br/> 3) <b>wide</b><br/> 4) in its current wording, it is impossible to determine the scope of application of the statement.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | <p>The scope of application of the provision is <b>wide</b>. The findings and conclusions obtained from the research are relevant to a broad range of stakeholders including researchers, media practitioners, policymakers, government institutions and organizations engaged in combating human trafficking. The provision offers insights that can be employed in the development of media policies, communication strategies, awareness campaigns and educational initiatives related to human trafficking.</p>                                                                                                                                            |
|  | <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article?<br/> 1) <b>yes</b>;<br/> 2) no<br/> 3) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify whether the statement has been proven in the article.</p> | <p>Although the study focuses on two newspapers from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia, the analytical approach and resulting conclusions have broader applicability to the study of media framing and social issues in other national and international contexts. The provision therefore possesses substantial theoretical and practical value and can be applied across various areas of media research, journalism practice and policy development.</p> | <p>The provision is <b>proven</b> in the author's published scholarly articles. The article "Human Trafficking in Media Coverage: Perspectives from Kazakhstan and Ethiopia," published in the Bulletin of L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, directly examines the nature, extent and visibility of human trafficking coverage in the media of the two countries. The study demonstrates that media attention devoted to human trafficking remains limited relative to the magnitude of the problem and discusses challenges affecting journalistic coverage. These findings support the dissertation's conclusions regarding the level of media</p> |

|  |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|--|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |  | <p>attention, issue visibility and thematic emphasis devoted to human trafficking in the selected newspapers.</p> <p>Further support is provided by the article “Exploring Media Framing Typologies of Human Trafficking in Contemporary Print Media,” published in the Bulletin of L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, applying framing theory to the analysis of human trafficking coverage, the study identifies dominant framing patterns, including attribution of responsibility, prognostic, diagnostic and motivational frames. These analytical findings are directly related to the dissertation’s examination of framing patterns and support the conclusions concerning the prevalence of educative, solution-oriented and attribution of responsibility frames as well as the representation of trafficking related issues in newspaper coverage.</p> <p>The author’s Springer book chapter provides important theoretical, methodological and analytical support for the dissertation. The publication examines the communication and representation of socially significant issues, focusing on visibility, thematic emphases, source utilization, communication strategies and representation patterns. These analytical dimensions closely correspond to the media representation approaches used in the dissertation. The methodological framework of systematic content analysis supplemented by qualitative in-depth interviews is also consistent with the research design adopted in the dissertation and contributes to the development of its analytical framework and interpretation of findings. Moreover, selected findings regarding</p> |
|--|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

|    |                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                       | <p>source usage, media representation and communication practices are incorporated into the dissertation for comparative analysis and contextual discussion.</p> <p>It is also provided by the conference proceeding which examined the media and NGOs collaboration in communicating human trafficking in Kazakhstan, focusing on communication strategies, media representation, advocacy campaigns, public awareness initiatives and anti-trafficking communication efforts.</p> <p>Overall, the author's publications address key aspects of the dissertation, including human trafficking coverage, media framing, source utilization, representation patterns, communication strategies, public discourse formation and anti-trafficking advocacy. The theoretical perspectives and methodological approaches and empirical findings presented in these publications are directly reflected in the dissertation and provide additional support for the validity, reliability, and scientific significance of its conclusions. Thus, the provision is adequately proven in the author's scholarly publications.</p> |
| 8. | <p>The principle of reliability.</p> <p>Reliability of sources and information provided</p> | <p>8.1 Choice of methodology is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail</p> <p>1) <u>yes</u>;</p> <p>2) no</p> | <p>The choice of methodology is justified and the research methodology is described in sufficient detail. The study primarily employed a systematic quantitative content analysis of human trafficking articles published in The Astana Times and The Ethiopian Herald newspapers with in a period of 60 months from September 2020 to September 2025, supported by a structured coding framework and comparative analysis. This methodology approach is appropriate for examining media framing patterns, thematic emphases, source usage, media</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                | functions and representational trends in the newspapers' coverage of human trafficking, thereby enabling the author to address the research objectives and questions effectively. Furthermore, qualitative in-depth interviews were conducted as a supplementary method to provide contextual insights and support the interpretation of the findings. The procedures for data collection, sampling, coding and data interpretation are clearly described and contribute to the reliability and validity of the research results.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|  | <p>8.2 The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies:</p> <p>1) <u>yes</u>;</p> <p>2) no</p> | <p>The results of the dissertation were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of data processing and interpretation with the aid of computer technologies. The study employs a systematic quantitative content analysis supported by structured coding procedures, coding sheets, data classification techniques and statistical organizations of the collected data. The selected methodological approach is appropriate for the research objectives and ensures the accuracy and consistency of the analysis.</p> <p>The author employed computer technologies for data management, processing, analysis and visualization. The collected data were systematically organized and analyzed using software tools, including spreadsheet applications while graphs, table and other visual representations were employed to present and interpret the findings effectively. The integration of contemporary analytical procedures and computer-assisted data processing enhances the reliability, transparency and scientific credibility of the research results.</p> |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|

|   |                           |                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|---|---------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                           |                                                                                                                                                                   | similarities and differences between Kazakhstan and Ethiopia. The literature review also incorporates relevant studies on media and human trafficking, framing theory, media framing approaches, framing types, contextual influences on framing and critiques of framing theory. The selected sources provide a strong theoretical and methodological foundation for the study and adequately support the analysis, interpretation and discussion of the research findings. |
| 9 | Practical value principle | <p>9.1 The thesis has theoretical value:</p> <p>1) <u>yes</u>;</p> <p>2) no</p>                                                                                   | <p>The dissertation has significant theoretical value. It contributes to the advancement of knowledge in media and communication studies by applying framing theory to the analysis of human trafficking coverage in "The Astana Times" and "The Ethiopian Herald" newspapers. The study expands the existing literature on media representation and provides new insights into the framing of socially significant issues in different media contexts.</p>                  |
|   |                           | <p>9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice:</p> <p>1) <u>yes</u>;</p> <p>2) no</p> | <p>The dissertation is of practical importance and has strong potential for application in practice. The findings provide valuable insights for media practitioners, policymakers, researchers and organizations involved in addressing human trafficking. The results can contribute to improving media reporting, communication strategies and public awareness initiatives related to human trafficking and other socially significant issues.</p>                        |
|   |                           | <p>9.3 Are the practice suggestions new?</p> <p>1) <u>completely new</u>;</p> <p>2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p> | <p>The practical recommendations proposed in the dissertation are <b>completely new</b>. They are based on original empirical findings and offer innovative insights for improving media reporting, communication strategies and public awareness regarding human trafficking. The recommendations constitute an original contribution to both</p>                                                                                                                           |

|     |                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-----|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 10. | The quality of writing and design | Academic writing quality:<br>1) <u>high</u> ;<br>2) average;<br>3) below average;<br>4) low.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | The academic writing quality of the dissertation is <b>high</b> . The dissertation is clearly structured and logically organized throughout. The author presents ideas and arguments in a coherent and academically rigorous manner. And, the language is precise, professional and appropriate for scholarly research. |
| 11. | Notes on a thesis                 | The dissertation is well-structured and methodologically rigorous study that makes a meaningful contribution to the fields of journalism, media and communication research. The research objectives have been successfully achieved and the conclusions are supported by empirical findings. Among the identified remarks, it may be noted that qualitative in-depth interviews were conducted only with reporters and editors of The Ethiopian Herald newspaper while the inclusion of journalists from both newspapers could have provided additional comparative insights into editorial practices and framing processes. Although attempts were made by the author to secure participation from journalists of The Astana Times newspaper through official correspondence and email communication, participation could not be obtained. Furthermore, the study is based on a limited period of analysis, and focuses exclusively on selected English-language newspaper editions which may not fully capture the diversity of human trafficking coverage across different media platforms and linguistic contexts. |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |

|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | The identified remarks do not affect the overall positive evaluation of the dissertation, the reliability of its results or the significance of its theoretical and practical contributions.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 12. | Scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the topic of research (in case of defense of the dissertation in the form of a series of articles, the official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each article of the doctoral student on the topic of research) | The scientific level of the doctoral student's publications on the research topic can be characterized as satisfactory. The published works address key issues related to human trafficking communication, media framing, media representation, communication strategies, source employment, public discourse and socially significant issues. In particular, the articles on human trafficking media coverage and framing provide empirical and theoretical support for the dissertation while the author's Springer publication and conference proceedings contribute important methodological, analytical and contextual perspectives. The publication employs appropriate quantitative and qualitative research methods and demonstrate the author's ability to apply established communication theories and rigorous analytical approaches. All in all, these works reflect the key theoretical, methodological and empirical dimensions of the dissertation and contribute to the advancement of knowledge in journalism, media and communication studies. |
| 13. | Decision of the official reviewer (pursuant to paragraph 28 of the present Model Regulations)                                                                                                                                                                                      | Dissertation research of Hafamu Kiros Tekare on the topic "The Comparative Analysis of Framing of Human Trafficking in Contemporary Print Media" is a completed scientific research. The work is performed at a high level and the applicant Hafamu Kiros Tekare deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program «8D03201 -Journalism».                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

**Official Reviewer:**

Assanova Gulnar Sairambekyzy  
PhD, Professor of Translation and Intercultural  
Communication Department (Kazakh Ablai Khan  
University of International Relations  
and World Languages  
(Almaty, Kazakhstan)



FULL NAME