

REVIEW
of the official reviewer for dissertation work
Yakasai Bashir Aliyu on the theme «The role of tribal relations in the system of public administration in Nigeria» presented for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty «8D03104 – Political Science».

№	Criteria	Eligibility (one of the options must be checked)	Justification of the position of the official reviewer
1.	The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs: 1) The thesis was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program) 2) The thesis was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program) 3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)	The dissertation topic fully aligns with the current research directions in political science concerning ethno-politics, public administration, political stability in multi-ethnic societies, national integration, and public trust. The study comprehensively examines the influence of kinship and tribal relations on the system of public administration in Nigeria, the effectiveness of state institutions, mechanisms for personnel selection and resource allocation, as well as citizens' trust in governing institutions. The dissertation is conceptually aligned with the priority areas for science development approved by the High Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, because it addresses issues of public administration, interethnic relations, the stability of political institutions, and inclusive governance in multiethnic societies within the framework of social and humanitarian sciences. In this regard, the dissertation topic fully aligns with current trends in scientific development and is significant for both theoretical and applied research in the field of political science.
2.	Importance for science	The work makes/does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed/not disclosed	The dissertation makes a significant contribution to the research areas of ethno-politics, public administration, and nation-building in political science. The author has conducted a comprehensive theoretical and empirical analysis of the ways in which clan and tribal relations in Nigeria influence the functioning of state governance institutions. The research

			findings provide a deeper understanding of governance effectiveness, public trust, and ethnic inclusivity in multi-ethnic societies. The scientific significance of the work is fully revealed.
3.	The principle of independence	Self-reliance level: 1) High; 2) Medium; 3) Low; 4) No independence	The dissertation was completed independently at a high level. The author independently defined the research problem, clearly formulated the dissertation's objectives and tasks, established its theoretical and methodological foundation, and systematically conducted the collection and analysis of empirical data. The theoretical concepts used in the study—Eke's "Two Societies" theory, the concept of prebendalism, the theory of consociationalism, and the institutional approach—were adapted by the author to the dissertation topic. The theoretical concepts used in the study—Eke's "Two Societies" theory, the concept of prebendalism, the theory of consociationalism, and the institutionalist approach—have been adapted by the author to the dissertation topic and integrated into a unique scientific model for analyzing kinship relations in Nigeria's system of public administration. The author's original contribution is also clearly evident in the empirical part of the study. The dissertation presents a case study of the 2023 Nigerian presidential election, survey results, statistical analysis, ethnographic observation materials, and findings from an assessment of factors influencing trust in public administration. The obtained results are summarized through the author's personal scientific conclusions. Therefore, the dissertation itself is rated as being of a high standard of writing.
4.	The principle of inner unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis: 1) Justified; 2) Partially justified;	The research topic is fully justified in its relevance, as it is directly connected to the issues of public administration effectiveness and interethnic relations in multi-ethnic states in the contemporary era.

		3) Not justified.	The structure and content of the dissertation fully correspond to the research topic and are aimed at comprehensively addressing the scientific problem posed.
		4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis: 1) Reflects; 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect	
		4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis: 1) <u>correspond</u> ; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond	
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected: 1) <u>completely interconnected</u> ; 2) the interconnection is partial; 3) there is no interconnection	
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions: 1) <u>there is a critical analysis</u> ; 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis does not represent one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors 4) the analysis is absent.	
5.	Scientific novelty principle	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The study provides a comprehensive analysis of the influence of kinship relations in Nigeria's system of public administration and empirically establishes the interrelationship between ethnic inclusivity and trust in public administration. Moreover, the study draws on well-established ethno-political, institutional, and public administration theories. Therefore, the scientific findings and propositions are considered not entirely

			new but partly novel; their novelty level is reflected at approximately 70-80%.
		5.2 Are the dissertation findings new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The dissertation's conclusions shed new light on the mechanisms by which ethnic factors influence the effectiveness of the public administration system. The author has uncovered the link between the principle of federal character, ethnic representation, public trust, and service delivery efficiency using concrete empirical data from Nigeria. Furthermore, since the conclusions are consistent with certain theoretical concepts, their novelty is assessed as partially new, at approximately 70-80%.
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and reasonable: 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The managerial decisions and practical recommendations presented in the dissertation are scientifically grounded and intended for practical application. They offer concrete recommendations for improving Nigeria's multi-ethnic public administration system, maintaining a balance between ethnic representation and meritocracy, enhancing public trust, and strengthening inclusive governance mechanisms. However, since these recommendations suggest ways to improve existing institutions rather than a completely new governance model, their novelty is assessed as only partial, at approximately 70-80%.
6.	The validity of the main findings	All main conclusions are/are not based on scientifically significant evidence or well-grounded (for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities)	All the main conclusions presented in the dissertation are based on extensive theoretical materials, survey results, statistical analysis findings, and concrete empirical data. The research findings fully substantiate the proposed hypotheses and are scientifically reliable.
7.	The main provisions for the defense	It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately: 7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) <u>proven</u> ; 2) rather proven;	7.1 The main propositions put forward for defense have been fully substantiated. The dissertation provides a comprehensive theoretical, historical, institutional, and empirical justification of the influence of kinship-clan relations in Nigeria's system of public administration. The author has demonstrated through

	3) rather not proven; 4) not proven 5) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify whether the statement has been proven. 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; 2) <u>no</u> 3) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify whether the statement is trivial. 7.3 Is it new? 1) <u>yes</u>; 2) no 3) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify the novelty of the statement. 7.4 Application level: 1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) <u>wide</u> 4) in its current wording, it is impossible to determine the scope of application of the statement. 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) <u>yes</u>; 2) no 3) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify whether the statement has been proven in the article.	concrete data the impact of kinship and ethnic factors on civil service recruitment, career advancement, resource allocation, political representation, public trust, and the effectiveness of public administration. The study's findings are confirmed by survey materials, a case analysis of the 2023 presidential election, ethnographic observation, and the results of statistical processing. Therefore, the level of evidence for the proposed rules is assessed as high. 7.2 The rules proposed for defense are not trivial. The author examines the issue of public administration in a multi-ethnic society not only from the perspective of general ethnic diversity, but also through the specific institutional, political, and administrative consequences of kinship relations. In particular, the empirical demonstration of the Federal Character Principle's impact on trust in public administration highlights the scientific distinctiveness of the study. In this regard, the proposed provisions do not repeat previously known general conclusions; rather, they offer a new scientific explanation in the case of Nigeria. 7.3. The main rules submitted for defense are scientifically novel. The dissertation provides a comprehensive examination of the role of kinship relations in Nigeria's public administration system, explaining the links among ethnic inclusivity, representation, service delivery efficiency, and public trust through an original analytical model. The study found that the Federal Character Impact indicator has a statistically significant positive effect on trust in public administration. This finding makes a new scientific contribution to explaining the legitimacy of governance in multi-ethnic societies. 7.4 The proposed rules of protection have a broad scope of application. The research findings are not limited to an analysis of Nigeria's public administration system but can also be
--	--	---

			applied to studying issues of interethnic relations, inclusive governance, political representation, national integration, and trust in state institutions in other multiethnic states. Furthermore, the dissertation's findings have practical significance for developing public administration reforms, improving inter-ethnic policy, and evaluating personnel policies and mechanisms of representation. 7.5 Yes, proven. The main principles to be defended are reflected in the doctoral candidate's published scientific works on the research topic. The list of scientific works includes articles in international and domestic publications directly related to the dissertation topic. In particular, the article "Role of Tribal Relations in the Public Administration system of Nigeria" was published in the Scopus Q1-ranked journal Public Integrity, while other works address Nigeria's public administration system, inter-ethnic relations, pluralistic society, the influence of tribes on the system of governance, and issues of public trust are examined. Accordingly, the main theses to be defended are considered to be sufficiently substantiated at the article level.
8.	The principle of reliability Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology - is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no	The choice of methodology is fully justified in accordance with the research objectives and tasks. The dissertation employs a combination of qualitative and quantitative methods: historical-institutional analysis, theoretical comparison, a case study of the 2023 Nigerian presidential election, ethnographic observation, and statistical processing based on survey results complement each other. This mixed methodology allowed for demonstrating the influence of kinship relations on the system of public administration not only at a descriptive level but also empirically and analytically. The methodological section clearly outlines the research logic, data collection methods, procedures for working with respondents, and ways of analyzing the obtained data. Therefore, the choice of

			methodology is considered justified and the methodology is assessed as being clearly written.
		8.2 The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies: <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no	The results of the dissertation were obtained using modern scientific research methods and data processing technologies. The author used computer programs and quantitative analysis tools to systematize, statistically process, and interpret the survey data. The study employed descriptive statistics, regression analysis, assessment of inter-variable relationships, model validation, and methods for interpreting the obtained results. Additionally, the qualitative materials were compared with the 2023 presidential election case and ethnographic observation data, thereby strengthening the validity of the results. Accordingly, the dissertation's findings are considered to have been obtained through the use of computer technologies and modern methodologies for data processing and interpretation.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment): <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no	The theoretical conclusions, analytical models, and identified interconnections presented in the dissertation have been tested and confirmed with empirical data. The author's "Two Societies" theories, the concept of prebendalism, and the institutional approach, substantiating his theoretical propositions by comparing them with survey results, a case study of the 2023 presidential election, and ethnographic observation materials. In particular, the influence of clan-tribal relations on trust in state governance, fairness in personnel selection, ethnic representation, and service efficiency has been demonstrated through concrete empirical data. Therefore, the theoretical conclusions and identified connections are sufficiently substantiated and confirmed by the research materials.

		8.4 Important statements are confirmed / partially <u>confirmed</u> by references to current and reliable scientific literature	The key statements in the dissertation are supported by references to specific and reliable scientific literature. The author draws on classical and contemporary scholarly works on ethno-politics, public administration, political institutions in multi-ethnic societies, federalism, consociationalism, prebendalism, and ethnic inclusivity. The literature used is sufficient to theoretically explore the research topic and allows the main conclusions of the dissertation to be placed in a scientific context. Moreover, theoretical sources are linked with empirical results, reinforcing the validity of the author's conclusions. Consequently, key statements are considered to be substantiated by references to reliable scientific literature.
		8.5 Used literature sources are sufficient for a literature review	The list of references is more than sufficient for a literature review. The dissertation includes classical and contemporary scholarly works on Nigeria's system of public administration, kinship and interethnic relations, federalism, consociationalism, prebendalism, institutional theory, and public trust. The literature allows for a comprehensive theoretical, historical, and empirical coverage of the research topic. Therefore, the volume and content of the literature used are considered sufficient to provide the scientific foundation for the dissertation research.
9	Practical value principle	9.1 The thesis has theoretical value: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The theoretical significance of the dissertation is high. The study contributes to deepening the theoretical understanding of ethno-politics, public administration, comparative politics, national integration, and political stability in multi-ethnic societies within the discipline of political science. The author examines the influence of kinship relations on state governance institutions in Nigeria, not only as a socio-cultural phenomenon but also as a structural factor of the political-administrative system. The theoretical value of the work lies in its synthesis of scholarly approaches such as Eken's "Two Societies" theory,

			the concept of prebendalism, consociationalism, and the institutionalist approach within a single study. This theoretical synthesis allows for a new interpretation of the interrelationship between governance legitimacy, ethnic representation, inclusivity, and public trust in multi-ethnic states. The dissertation's findings can serve as an important scientific foundation for assessing the effectiveness of the public administration system in multi-ethnic societies, explaining the influence of ethnic factors on political institutions, and theoretically substantiating the mechanisms of national integration. Therefore, the dissertation has theoretical significance and contributes to the development of the aforementioned areas of political science.
		9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice: 1) yes; 2) no	The dissertation has significant practical importance, and there is an opportunity to apply the obtained results in practice. The research findings can be used to improve ethnic representation, personnel policy, resource allocation, public service recruitment, and mechanisms for enhancing public trust in Nigeria's system of public administration. The author's conclusions and practical recommendations have applied significance for developing public administration reforms in multi-ethnic societies, improving inter-ethnic policy, strengthening the principles of inclusive representation, and enhancing the legitimacy of state institutions. In particular, the analysis of the impact of the principle of federal character on public trust highlights the need to reconcile ethnic balance and meritocratic requirements in the civil service. The research findings can be used by government agencies, political parties, experts in interethnic relations, institutions developing public administration reforms, and higher education institutions for teaching and methodological purposes. Moreover, the dissertation's findings are also

			significant as a comparative example for other multi-ethnic states in the issue of balancing ethnic inclusivity and governance effectiveness. Accordingly, the dissertation has practical significance, and the obtained results are considered highly applicable in practice.
		9.3 Are the practice suggestions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The practical recommendations are scientifically grounded and aimed at application in public administration. They address ethnic representation, personnel policy, They have specific practical significance in areas such as improving the principle of federalism, inclusive governance, and enhancing public trust. Furthermore, since the recommendations are intended to improve existing management mechanisms rather than fully replace them, their novelty is assessed as being of a partly new nature, at approximately 70-80%.
10.	The quality of writing and design	Academic writing quality: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The dissertation is written at a high academic level. The structure of the work is logically organized, the scientific style is maintained, and the tables and appendices are formatted in accordance with requirements. The quality of the academic writing is rated at a high level.
11.	Notes on a thesis		Although the dissertation comprehensively analyzes the influence of kinship relations in public administration, comparing the research findings with other multi-ethnic African states would enhance its theoretical and practical significance. (e.g., Kenya, Ethiopia, or Ghana) would enhance the theoretical and practical significance of the study. The author demonstrates the influence of the principle of federalism as a key factor in trust in governance; however, the validity of the conclusions would be strengthened by a more extensive analysis of this institution's long-term effectiveness and potential limitations. Although the study's empirical base is sufficient, the interpretation of some statistical results and the mechanisms

			for their implementation into public policy could have been presented more clearly. Since the volume of theoretical material in some sections is quite substantial, condensing it and increasing the proportion of the author's own conclusions would further strengthen the structural integrity of the work.
12.	Scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the topic of research (in case of defense of the dissertation in the form of a series of articles, the official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each article of the doctoral student on the topic of research)		The doctoral candidate's research findings are reflected in nine publications listed in the list of scientific works. Among them are articles in international and domestic scientific journals directly related to the dissertation topic. In particular, the article "Role of Tribal Relations in the Public Administration system of Nigeria" was published in the Q1-ranked journal Public Integrity in the Scopus database. The published works are fully consistent with the dissertation topic, contain the main results and conclusions of the research, and demonstrate that they have undergone scientific review. The articles scientifically substantiate issues concerning Nigeria's system of public administration, the influence of kinship relations on public administration, the role of ethnic politics in electoral processes, pluralistic society, public trust, and the effectiveness of state institutions. The doctoral candidate's publications confirm the novelty, theoretical, and practical significance of the research results.
13.	Decision of the official reviewer (pursuant to paragraph 28 of the present Model Regulations)		Yakassai Bashir Aliyu's Yakasai Bashir Aliyu's dissertation, titled "The Role of Clan Relations in Nigeria's System of Public Administration," fully meets the requirements of the Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) degree set by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The dissertation research is aimed at solving a relevant scientific problem, has scientific novelty, and significant theoretical and practical importance. The obtained results are sufficiently substantiated and are reflected in published scientific works. The research was conducted independently.

